Stáisiún Uí Chonghaile, Baile Átha Cliath 1, D01 V6V6 Connolly Station, Dublin 1, D01 V6V6 T 01 703 4293 E foi@irishrail.ie W www.irishrail.ie



13th September 2020

| Email: | | |
|--------|--|--|
| | | |
| | | |

Re: Response FOI request IE_FOI_395

Dear

I refer to your request dated 8th August 2020 made under the Freedom of Information Act 2014, which was received on that date, for records held by larnród Éireann.

Request:

- For the Coolmine Level Crossing Assessment only: •
- Can you please provide any, and all materials related to the creation of the MCA1 and MCA2 document?
- Where is the data that informs the ratings being assigned? e.g. cost of each option, number of dwellings affected by noise pollution or air pollution.
- How is the colour coding determined for each category and subcategory?
- Can you also provide confirmation (as per the statements made in the webinar) that there are no weightings assigned on the 6 main categories (and 24 subcategories) in the MCA document and that all selections
- Can you confirm the date in which the MCA1 document was created?
- Can you confirm the date in which the MCA2 document was created?
- Can you confirm if the same or a different data set was used in creating MCA1 over MCA2?

Response:

, have made the decision to grant your request. Please find response document and schedule of records now enclosed.

Rights of appeal

In the event that you are not happy with this decision you can make an appeal in relation to this matter, you can do so by writing to the FOI Unit, Corporate Communications, Jarnród Éireann Irish Rail, Connolly Station, Amiens St, Dublin 1 or by e-mail to foi@irishrail.ie. You should make your appeal within 4 weeks (20 working days) from the date of this notification, where a day is defined as a working day excluding, the weekend and public holidays, however, the making of a late appeal may be permitted in appropriate circumstances.

The appeal will involve a complete reconsideration of the matter by a more senior member of the staff of this body.

Cathaoirleach Chairman - P Gaffney(UK), Stiúrthóirí Directors: F Allen, C Griffiths (UK), T McGee(UK), M McGreevy (UK), J Moloney; F O'Mahony, T Wynne; Príomh Fheidhmeannach Chief Executive: D Franks Iarnród Éireann – Irish Rail, cuideachta ghníomhaíochta ainmnithe, faoi theorainn scaireanna, cláraithe in Éirinn ag Stáisiún Uí Chonghaile, Baile Átha Cliath 1, Ur. 119571 Ur. CBL IE 4812851 O

larnród Lireann – Irish Rail, a designated activity company, limited by shares, registered in Ireland at Connolly Station, Dublin 1, No. 119571 VAT No. IE 4812851 O

Should you have any questions or concerns regarding the above, please contact the FOI Officer on 01-7034293 or by email at foi@irishrail.ie

Yours sincerely,



Decision Maker, New Works & Capital Investment Iarnród Éireann

Freedom of Information Request: Schedule of Records for IE_FOI_395 : Summary for Decision Making

| | | | | Decision: | | Record |
|------------|----------------|------------------------------|--------|--------------|----------------|-----------------|
| | | | No. of | Grant/Part | Section of Act | Edited/Identify |
| Record No. | Date of Record | Brief Description | Pages | Grant/Refuse | if applicable | Deletions |
| 1 | 13.10.2020 | IE_FOI_395 Response Document | 2 | Grant | ~ | ~ |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |

Signed:

Freedom of Information / Data Protection Executive

IE FOI 395 Response Document

For the Coolmine Level Crossing Assessment only:

1. Can you please provide any, and all materials related to the creation of the MCA1 and MCA2 document?

All material in relation to MCA 1 and MCA2 is included in the Preliminary Option Selection Report, more especially the MCA Matrices provided in Annex 9.3A and 9.3B.

Following the completion of first round of Public Consultations all public feedback will be assessed and the MCA process will be reassessed and recalibrated. Further details of the MCA process will be provided in the Option Selection Report to be published as part of the non-statutory Public Consultation No.2.

2. Where is the data that informs the ratings being assigned? e.g. cost of each option, number of dwellings affected by noise pollution or air pollution.

The data relevant to the Preliminary Option Selection Report is provided in the Preliminary Option Selection Report and Annexes 9.3A and 9.3B.

Further details will be provided in the Option Selection Report to be published as part of Public Consultation No.2.

3. How is the colour coding determined for each category and subcategory?

The MCA process and the colour coding/assessment is determined by the project team using the methodology and process detailed in Section 5 of the Preliminary Options Selection Report. The MCA process and the scoring is seeking to adhere to the recommendations of the Common Appraisal Framework for Transport Projects and Programmes guidelines, published by the Department of Transport (2016).

4. Can you also provide confirmation (as per the statements made in the webinar) that there are no weightings assigned on the 6 main categories (and 24 subcategories) in the MCA document and that all selections

As confirmed in the webinars, no weightings have been applied between the parameters, the criteria or the sub-criteria. The MCA process is an objective, non-weighted and comparative analysis process.

5. Can you confirm the date in which the MCA1 document was created?

Exact calendar dates cannot be provided, because the MCA1 and MCA2 process are inter-related. The MCA1 process was used to short list more advantageous options to proceed to the MCA2 process. During the MCA2 process, as greater detail of the selected options was gathered on options being assessed in MCA2, there was regular lookback at the MCA1 option matrices. Preliminary MCA1 and MCA2 matrices were not closed until the completion of the Preliminary Option Selection Report which was published on 26th August 2020.

The MCA1 and MCA2 matrices will be reassessed and recalibrated when feedback from the Public Consultation No. 1 is obtained. The final MCA1 and MCA2 matrices will be finalised for inclusion in the Options Selection Report which will be published in the Option Selection Report, to be published at the launch of the second round of Public Consultations.

6. Can you confirm the date in which the MCA2 document was created? See response to Query 5.

7. Can you confirm if the same or a different data set was used in creating MCA1 over MCA2? The same Criteria and Sub-Criteria headings were used in MCA1 and MCA2. However, a greater level of detail was collated during the MCA2 process. This information is provided in Annex 9.3A for MCA1 and Annex 9.3B for MCA 2, as part of the Preliminary Option Selection Report. Link below: <u>https://www.irishrail.ie/about-us/iarnrod-eireann-projects-and-investments/DART-</u> <u>Programme/DART-West-Public-Consultation/DART-West-Line-Useful-Material-and-Downloads/DART-West-Preliminary-Options-Selection-Report</u>