

20th August 2019

[Redacted]
[Redacted]
[Redacted]
[Redacted]
[Redacted]

Re: Response - FOI request IE_FOI_259

Dear [Redacted],

I refer to your request dated 4th June 2019 made under the Freedom of Information Act 2014, which was received on that date, for records held by Iarnród Éireann.

Request:

- A copy of all correspondence and meeting minutes between members of Irish Rail, at principal officer level and above, and representatives of the National Transport Authority and the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport relating to the decision to not proceed with the refurbishment of 14 two carriage Class 2700 train sets in the time period between November 1st 2018 and March 15th 2019.

I, Lynette O'Toole, have now made a final decision to grant your request on June 2019.

You have sought access to the records as listed above and I consider this an appropriate form of access in this case.

Accordingly, a copy of the records is now attached including a copy of the schedule to these records.

Rights of appeal

In the event that you are not happy with this decision you can make an appeal in relation to this matter, you can do so by writing to the FOI Unit, Corporate Communications, Iarnród Éireann Irish Rail, Connolly Station, Amiens St, Dublin 1 or by e-mail to foi@irishrail.ie. You should make your appeal within 4 weeks (20 working days) from the date of this notification, where a day is defined as a working day excluding, the weekend and public holidays, however, the making of a late appeal may be permitted in appropriate circumstances.

The appeal will involve a complete reconsideration of the matter by a more senior member of the staff of this body.

Should you have any questions or concerns regarding the above, please contact the FOI Officer on 01, 7034293.

Yours sincerely,



Lynette O'Toole,
FOI Decision Maker.

Minutes of Meeting

Date: 28-Nov-2018 **Time :** 08.30 – 09.30
Location: NTA Offices, Harcourt Lane

DART Expansion Programme – Planning Stage Steering Mtg #10

Participants :

NTA

Iarnród Éireann

	Minute	Action	Due Date
1.	Admin : Minutes of last meeting 14 th Nov accepted with correction to Lease tender		
2.	Work Package 1 - Rolling Stock Study NTA state Capacity of Rail Fleet now no. 1 issue for transport and – must get started in Dec. Fleet Strategy workshop next Friday - lots of comments on draft 3 NTA request site visit to see 2700 units	IE IE/NTA IE IE	ASAP ASAP asap
3.	Work Package 2 – City Centre Connolly – Progress mtg due 8 th Dec - Pressure needs to be put on to produce options Docklands – satisfactory progress with options agreed at workshop Metro scheme interface details not yet received	NTA TII	Asap asap
4.	Work Package 3 – Maynooth Line Works Traffic Study – 1 st progress mtg held and draft program agreed CSEA preparing Requirements for traffic survey HC contacted will act for Fingal		
5.	Work Package 4 – Kildare Line Works Report issued to NTA today - cost section to follow within a few day	IE	11/12/18
6.	Work Package 5 – Northern Line Works - No immediate actions		
7.	Work Package 6 – South-East Line Works - No immediate actions NTA to issue JE report on Bray-Greystones to IE Discussion whether we need similar traffic study to Maynooth on SE Line - suggests to be done with Bus Connects	NTA NTA	4/12/18 tba
8.	Other Studies • Electrification Report due end Nov but more likely by end Dec NTA request their attendance at next progress meeting • • •	IE IE NTA	asap 6/12/18 asap
9.	Any other Business • RO Strategy of RO by line prepared concurrently confirmed Concern of potential challenge on Electrification without RO • report now received – IE to confirm comments. • • NTA to confirm budget approval • NTA to provide cash flow per 6 year plan – priority is fleet •	NTA IE NTA NTA NTA	asap asap asap asap Feb 19

<i>Author:</i> Chief Mechanical Engineer	FILE NOTE – CLASS 2700 DMU REFURBISHMENT UPDATE	<i>Reviewed by:</i>
<i>Submitted by:</i> Chief Mechanical Engineer		<i>Approved by:</i> Director RU

1. SUMMARY

This paper provides an update on the current position with the Class 2700 Refurbishment project which is funded by the NTA to the tune [REDACTED]

2. BACKGROUND

The 14 x 2 Class 2700 DMU trains manufactured in 1998 have been in storage since 2012 and are in a poor state needing extensive refurbishment for a return to service. It was decided in 2016 that the optimum and quickest route to refurbish and reintroduce this fleet to service was via a turnkey project via an EU level tender. In preparation for the tender, extensive research work took place in 2015 and 2016 with [REDACTED] who are the [REDACTED]. The research looked at the work needed and the likely cost for packages of work. Based on this and experience with similar projects this set the budget level at an eventual [REDACTED]. The expectation was a tender process resulting in an award of contract in late 2018 and the fleet returning to service in late 2020.

The Technical Specification was completed by Irish Rail. It is a detailed technical specification listing all the work elements with supporting information needed to bring the train up to an acceptable standard. The work required is a combination of standard overhaul e.g corrosion repair, repaint, bogie overhaul, brake system overhaul, door overhaul, seat covers and such like and work to address any outstanding modification work on the fleet e.g the mandatory data recorder.

The work was divided into two; Core work – essential works and Optional work – Items that could be considered if budget permitted. Before the tender was issued the IE Board asked for one item to be moved from optional into essential requirements. This was the fitment of a passenger information system estimated at [REDACTED].

3. TENDER PROCESS

The OJEU Notice was issued on 07/07/2017 and this generated [REDACTED] x prequalification submissions. Following evaluation [REDACTED] x experienced parties were invited to the Tender Stage.

Tender round 1 was issued on 19/02/2018

- Closing Date for Returns (extended twice) was 27/04/2018
- [REDACTED] parties officially withdrew or did not submit a bid
- [REDACTED] parties submitted tender packs for Round 1

Tender Pack Round 2 Issued on 20/07/2018

- Closing Date for Returns (extended once) was 31/08/2018

- [REDACTED] party withdrew from the process as they had been sold off by their parent
- This left [REDACTED] party in the competition who submitted a BAFO

4. TENDER COST

The tendered cost for Core Work [REDACTED]

[REDACTED].

This does not include any of the optional items specified. It also does not include emerging costs for issues that emerge during the refurbishment such as extensive corrosion or hidden damage repair. It would be typical to [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

5. ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSION

The tendered cost for core work [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

The refurbishment content will bring the vehicles up to a good standard however there are many elements of the train that won't be touched in this process and doubtless will be the problem area or limiting factor going forward.

A rail vehicle will have a useful asset life of 35 years. The Class 2700 fleet is already nearly 20 years old and it does not make economic sense nor support a strong business case to proceed with this work on the Class 2700 at the tendered cost.

I

Chief Mechanical Engineer

Inchicore

October 2018

CHIEF MECHANICAL ENGINEER

KEY ISSUES

PERIOD 12, 2018

2700 Re introduction.

The IE Board and the NTA have been advised that the tendered cost of refurbishment of the Class 2700 Fleet is [REDACTED]. A team from the NTA visited Inchicore in December to view a selection of the vehicles to support their understanding of the fleet condition.

CHIEF MECHANICAL ENGINEER

KEY ISSUES

PERIOD 13, 2018

2700 Re introduction.

The IE Board and the NTA have been advised that the [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] will not proceed. A team from the NTA visited Inchicore in December to view a selection of the vehicles to support their understanding of the fleet condition. The project has now concluded.

CHIEF MECHANICAL ENGINEER

KEY ISSUES

PERIOD 1, 2019

2700 Re introduction.

The IE Board and the NTA have been advised that the [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] will not proceed. A team from the NTA visited Inchicore in December to view a selection of the vehicles to support their understanding of the fleet condition. The project has now concluded.

Short Term Fleet Capacity Update October 2018

Advisory Note-

1 OBJECTIVE

This document provides an update on the short term fleet strategy and capacity enhancement in the short term until 2023. It should be read in conjunction with the advisory note presented to the IE board in August 2018 on overall fleet strategy.

Following the deployment of the DART 10 minute timetable which provides additional capacity on the DART service there are three additional options being pursued in terms of short term commuter fleet capacity enhancement for the Dublin area.

2 CLASS 2700 DMU REFURBISHMENT

The 14 x 2 Class 2700 DMU trains manufactured in 1998 have been in storage since 2012 and are in a poor state needing extensive refurbishment for a return to service. It was decided in 2016 that the optimum and quickest route to refurbish and reintroduce this fleet to service was via a turnkey project via an EU level tender. In preparation for the tender, extensive research work took place in 2015 and 2016 with [REDACTED] who are the [REDACTED]. The research looked at the work needed and the likely cost for packages of work. Based on this and experience with similar projects this set the budget level at an eventual [REDACTED]. The expectation was a tender process resulting in an award of contract in late 2018 and the fleet returning to service in late 2020.

The Technical Specification was completed by Irish Rail. It is a detailed technical specification listing all the work elements with supporting information needed to bring the train up to an acceptable standard. The work required is a combination of standard overhaul e.g corrosion repair, repaint, bogie overhaul, brake system overhaul, door overhaul, seat covers and such like and work to address any outstanding modification work on the fleet e.g the mandatory data recorder.

The work was divided into two; Core work – essential works and Optional work – Items that could be considered if budget permitted. Before the tender was issued the IE Board asked for one item to be moved from optional into essential requirements. This was the fitment of a passenger information system estimated [REDACTED].

Tender process

The OJEU Notice was issued on 07/07/2017 and this generated [REDACTED] prequalification submissions. Following evaluation [REDACTED] experienced parties were invited to the Tender Stage. Tender round 1 was issued on 19/02/2018

- Closing Date for Returns (extended twice) was 27/04/2018
- [REDACTED] parties officially withdrew or did not submit a bid
- [REDACTED] parties submitted tender packs for Round 1

Tender Pack Round 2 Issued on 20/07/2018

- Closing Date for Returns (extended once) was 31/08/2018

- [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]

Tender returns

The tendered cost for Core Work only came in at [REDACTED] for all 28 vehicles. This does not include any of the optional items specified. It also does not include emerging costs for issues that emerge during the refurbishment such as extensive corrosion or hidden damage repair. It would be typical to add a contingency figure of [REDACTED] for this element on this type of project bringing the project close to [REDACTED].

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED].

The tendered cost for core work only is nearly [REDACTED] and represents a cost of nearly [REDACTED] per vehicle which should be compared against a brand new cost of [REDACTED] per vehicle. The refurbishment content will bring the vehicles up to a good standard however there are many elements of the train that won't be touched in this process and doubtless will be the problem area or limiting factor going forward.

3 SECOND HAND FLEET

IE recently completed a review for the NTA of available DMU trains from the UK that could be purchased or leased long term. The best potential fit is 22 x 3 car trains from the Class 185 DMU fleet of 51 x 3 car sets operated by [REDACTED] which is currently available from the [REDACTED] as they have been replaced by longer trains. These are 23m cars with 1/3 and 2/3 door configuration operating at 160 kph. They were built in 2006 by [REDACTED] and are regarded as excellent trains with good capacity, acceleration and top speed. They are maintained by the manufacturer and are in excellent condition and would be a very good fit for IE services.

A number of meetings have taken place with the owners ([REDACTED]) and the NTA to explore the feasibility further and there is considerable interest on both sides. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] The trains would need bogie modifications to fit the gauge and certain cab modifications - the most critical being a compliant train protection system. A possible option to consider could be the fitting of [REDACTED] from the 2700 fleet if this was deemed a more suitable investment instead. Allowing 1 year for modification and approvals these trains could be in service at the end of 2020. This is seen as the best short term option for fleet capacity. The NTA is also very supportive of this option as this provides nearly three times the capacity of the Class 2700 fleet and are faster accelerating trains with a higher top speed.

In addition CME are also in discussion with [REDACTED] regarding a similar number of Class 170 DMUs also coming off lease in early 2020. If the [REDACTED] deal failed to materialise then this could offer an alternative solution.

Procurement options

Discussions have taken place with IE procurement regarding the process for acquiring 2nd hand trains. It is very important that if we are to secure these trains that we can move quickly to close a commercial agreement. The current view is that there are two scenarios [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] A precedent exists within the [REDACTED] using a similar approach in recent years.

The operating leasing of rail vehicles is not familiar in Ireland and due consideration will need to be given to the tax, VAT and accounting treatment to be applied.

4 INTERMEDIATE ICR VEHICLES

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED].

The NTA are generally not supportive of this fleet type for serving the GDA commuters as they are [REDACTED] however a strong case can be made to use them initially to support commuter services and then use them to strengthen longer distance Intercity services which are seeing significant growth. This aspect will be factored into the current NTA led Jacobs review in order to gain support for the proposal.

5 CONCLUSIONS

- A rail vehicle will have a useful asset life of 35 years. The Class 2700 fleet is already nearly 20 years old and it does not make economic sense nor support a strong business case to proceed with the refurbishment work on the Class 2700 [REDACTED]
- The 2nd hand fleet option represents the best option to pursue to add short term capacity however procurement and finance support will be needed in an unfamiliar process if an agreement is to be reached quickly in a highly competitive market.
- The Intermediate ICR vehicles should be the fall back option to implement in the event that the 2nd hand fleet cannot be secured.

Peter Smyth
Chief Mechanical Engineer
October 2018